

**Court of Appeals, Division One**

**Criminal**

**1 CA-CR 21-0541**

**STATE v. PURCELL**

**Appellate Case Information**

Case Filed: 1-Dec-2021

Case Closed: 14-Apr-2022

Reinstated x 1: 3-May-2023 Dismissal

Re-Closed:

**Dept/Composition**

**Department A**

Hon. Angela K Paton  
Hon. Michael S Catlett  
Hon. James B Morse

Consolidated with: 1 CA-CR 21-0512 1 CA-CR 22-0061 1 CA-CR 22-0071

**Side 1. STATE OF ARIZONA, Appellee**

(Litigant Group) STATE OF ARIZONA

- State of Arizona

**Attorneys for: Respondent**

Eliza Ybarra, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 22395)

**Side 2. BOBBY CHARLES PURCELL, Appellant**

(Litigant Group) BOBBY CHARLES PURCELL

- Bobby Charles Purcell

**Attorneys for: Petitioner**

Tara R DeGeorge, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 31580)

Kevin D Heade, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 29909)

**Side 3. MARICOPA COUNTY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE, Amicus Curiae**

(Litigant Group) MARICOPA COUNTY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE

- Maricopa County Attorney's Office

**Attorneys for: Amicus Curiae**

Julie A Done, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 24370)

Kirsten Valenzuela, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 21369)

**CASE STATUS**

Apr 26, 2024....Assigned

PREDECESSOR CASE (S)	Cause/Charge/Class	Judgment/Sentence	Judge, Role <Comments>	Trial	Dispo
MAR CR1998-008705			Patricia A Starr, Judge on PC		

**DESCENDENT CASE (S)**

ASC CR-21-0398-PR

**CASE DECISION**

07-Dec-2021 ORDER

\*\*\*Vacated\*\*\*

ORDERED: Dismissing this appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Vacating the order of 12/01/2021, directing the Clerk of the Maricopa County Superior Court to transmit the record on appeal to the Clerk of this court by 01/18/2022.

Filed: 07-Dec-2021

Mandate:

Decision Disposition

**Dismissed**

Benjamin Armstrong.....Author

**51 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

- 1-Dec-2021 FILED: Notice of Appeal from Superior Court. Notification sent to Court Reporters dated 11/30/2021.
- 1-Dec-2021 ORDERED: Clerk of Maricopa County Superior Court to transmit record on appeal, including but not limited to reporter's transcripts and exhibits, to clerk, Court of Appeals, on/before 01/18/2022. Amy M Wood - Author
- 7-Dec-2021 ORDERED: Dismissing this appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Vacating the order of 12/01/2021, directing the Clerk of the Maricopa County Superior Court to transmit the record on appeal to the Clerk of this court by 01/18/2022. Benjamin A Armstrong ProTem Judge - Author
- 8-Dec-2021 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 10/07/2021 - Oral Argument (Kristyn Lobry)

**Court of Appeals, Division One****Criminal****1 CA-CR 21-0541****STATE v. PURCELL****51 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

5. 10-Dec-2021 FILED: Notice of Appearance; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
6. 10-Dec-2021 FILED: Motion for Reconsideration: Order Dismissing Appeal of Dismissal of Resentencing; Certificate of Compliance with Rule 31.20(e), ARCP; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
7. 10-Dec-2021 FILED: Motion to Delete Pre-Remand Transcripts from the Record on Appeal; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
8. 21-Dec-2021 ORDERED: Motion for Reconsideration: Order Dismissing Appeal of Dismissal of Resentencing (Appellant) = DENIED. FURTHER ORDERED: Denying the request for oral argument. Hon Kent E Cattani - Author
9. 21-Dec-2021 ORDERED: Motion to Delete Pre-Remand Transcripts from the Record on Appeal (Appellant) = DENIED. Benjamin A Armstrong ProTem Judge - Author
10. 27-Dec-2021 FILED: Email Notice from ASC re: Petition for Review filed 12/22/21; request for partial record
11. 27-Dec-2021 FILED: Letter forwarding partial record to Arizona Supreme Court
12. 14-Jan-2022 FILED: Additional Record on Appeal  
Physical Exhibits:  
Hearing Date: 06/07/1999 List # 1 in manila envelope  
Hearing Date: 06/07/1999 - List # 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46 47 48 49 50 51 53 54 63 64 65 66 67 68 69 70 71 72 74 75 76 77 78 79 103 106 107 108 109 110 111 112 113 114 115 116 in a manila envelope  
Hearing Date: 04/23/1999 - List # 1 in a manila envelope  
Hearing Date: 09/10/1999 - List # 1 2 in a manila envelope
13. 14-Jan-2022 FILED: e-Record on Appeal:  
Instruments/Minute Entries: Combined  
Disposition Report: 238  
Exhibits: None sent with e-Record
14. 6-Apr-2022 FILED: Letter from ASC, 04/06/2022, re: Petition for Review GRANTED on 04/05/2022.
15. 11-Apr-2022 FILED: ASC Order filed 04/11/2022 re: that the above-captioned cases are consolidated. FURTHER ORDERED: Amending the caption as reflected above. This caption shall be used on all further documents filed in this appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: That the primary case number is designated as CR-21-0398, State of Arizona v. Bobby Charles Purcell. FURTHER ORDERED: That counsel for the State of Arizona and counsel for Petitioner Purcell and Appellant DeShaw may each simultaneously file a single supplemental brief addressing the single issue of whether the Court of Appeals erred by concluding that it did not have appellate jurisdiction over the dismissal of the resentencing proceedings. Any amicus briefs are due on or before 05/09/2022, and any responses to amicus briefs are due on or before 05/31/2022. Amicus briefs or responses may not exceed 20 pages in length. FURTHER ORDERED: That these matters will be set for a single oral argument.
16. 14-Apr-2022 FILED: Letter, 04/14/2022 from Arizona Supreme Court granting petition for review, the entire file is transferred.
17. 1-May-2023 FILED: Arizona Supreme Court Mandate to Court of Appeals, Division One - COA1 Dismissal Order Vacated - Remanded to COA1
18. 3-May-2023 ORDERED: Reinstating this appeal. Hon Samuel A Thumma - Author
19. 6-Jun-2023 FILED: Notice of Appearance; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
20. 12-Jun-2023 FILED: Notice of Concession of Error; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
21. 14-Jun-2023 FILED: Amicus Curiae Brief Of The Maricopa County Attorney's Office; Certificate Of Compliance For Amicus Curiae Brief Of The Maricopa County Attorney's Office; Certificate Of Service For Amicus Curiae Brief Of The Maricopa County Attorney's Office (Amicus Curiae)
22. 21-Jun-2023 ORDERED: Consolidating cases 1 CA-CR 21-0512, 1 CA-CR 21-0541, 1 CA-CR 22-0061, and 1 CA-CR 22-0071. Case no. 1 CA-CR 21-0512 is designated the primary number, and the caption shown above must be used on all future documents filed in this appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Directing the clerk of this court to issue a Notice of Completion for this consolidated case once the record is fully complete in all member cases. FURTHER ORDERED: The deadline to file a response to the Maricopa County Attorney's Office's amicus brief will be the same date as the opening brief deadline set in the Notice of Completion. FURTHER ORDERED: Notice of Concession of Error (Appellee) = TAKING NO ACTION. Nothing precludes the State from filing a new Concession of Error after the opening briefs are filed. Hon Kent E Cattani - Author

Court of Appeals, Division One

Criminal

1 CA-CR 21-0541

STATE v. PURCELL

51 PROCEEDING ENTRIES

- 23. 22-Jun-2023 FILED: Additional Record on Appeal  
Physical Exhibits:  
Hearing Date: 02/09/1996 List # 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 in manila envelope  
Hearing Date: 10/28/1996 List # 187 188 190 194 195 in manila envelope  
Hearing Date: 12/02/1996 List # 8.001 11 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45  
46 47 48 49 50 51 52 53 54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65 66 67 68 69 70 71 72 73 74 75 76 77 78 79 80 81 82 83 84 85 86  
87 88 89 90 91 92 93 94 95 96 97 98 99 100 101 102 103 104 105 106 107 108 109 110 111 112 113 114 115 116 117 118 119  
120 121 122 123 124 125 126 127 128 129 130 131 132 133 134 135 136 137 138 139 140 141 142 143 144 145 146 147 148  
149 150 151 152 153 154 155 156 157 158 159 160 161 162 163 164 165 166 167 168 169 170 171 172 173 174 175 176 177  
178 185 186 187 188 189 190 191 192 in manila envelope  
Hearing Date: 07/11/1997 List # 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 in manila envelope  
Hearing Date: 08/29/1997 List # 1 2 in a box
- 24. 10-Jul-2023 FILED: Notice of Completion of Record
- 25. 24-Jul-2023 FILED: Request for Procedural Order: Motion to Supplement Record - And - Request to Extend Time to File the Opening Brief Until the Record is Supplemented; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
- 26. 24-Jul-2023 FILED: Request for Procedural Order: Motion to Supplement Record - And - Request to Extend Time to File the Opening Brief Until the Record is Supplemented (Second Request); Certificate of Service (Appellant)
- 27. 1-Aug-2023 ORDERED: Motion to Supplement Record (Appellant) = GRANTED and directing court reporter supervisor Vanessa Gartner to prepare transcript dated 06/11/2019 for the hearing at which Celeste Paxton-Jones was the court reporter designated above due 09/15/2023. FURTHER ORDERED: Ken Crenshaw Transcript for digitally recorded hearing on 08/09/2019, due 09/15/2023. FURTHER ORDERED: Directing court reporters Marylynn LeMoine, Wanda Bauer, and Gail Ferguson Transcripts dated 07/12/2019, 06/02/2021, 10/12/2018, due 09/15/2023 (See Order). FURTHER ORDERED: Motion to Supplement Record (Second Request) = GRANTED. FURTHER ORDERED: Request to Extend Time to File the Opening Brief Until the Record is Supplemented = GRANTED. Due date EXTENDED from Thursday, 08-24-2023 to Monday, 10-16-2023. Geoffrey P Butzine ProTem Judge - Author
- 28. 9-Aug-2023 FILED: The State's Response to Brief of Amicus Curiae; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
- 29. 24-Aug-2023 FILED: Joint Response to MCAO Amicus Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
- 30. 5-Sep-2023 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 06/02/2021 - Reporter's Transcript of Proceedings - (Wanda Bauer)
- 31. 10-Sep-2023 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 06/11/2019 - Status Conference - (Terry Masciola)
- 32. 15-Sep-2023 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 07/12/2019 - Oral Argument - (Marylynn LeMoine Cotton)
- 33. 28-Sep-2023 FILED: Notice of Supplemental Authority; Certificate of Service for Notice of Supplemental Authority (Amicus Curiae)
- 34. 29-Sep-2023 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 08/09/2019 - Status Conference (Brian Gemma)
- 35. 5-Oct-2023 ORDERED: Court Reporter Gail Ferguson transcript dated 10/12/2018 due or OSC set on 10/18/2023. Hon Randall M Howe - Author
- 36. 12-Oct-2023 FILED: Motion to Extend Time to File the Opening Brief; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
- 37. 16-Oct-2023 ORDERED: Motion to Extend Time to File the Opening Brief (Appellant) = GRANTED. Due date EXTENDED from 10/16/2023 to 11/15/2023 for Appellant's Opening Brief, Geoffrey P Butzine ProTem Judge - Author
- 38. 18-Oct-2023 ORDERED: Directing Court Reporting Supervisor Chris Bleuenstein to reassign the preparation of the transcripts designated above from Court Reporter Gail Ferguson to an available court reporter, and to furnish one copy to appellant's counsel, one copy to appellee's counsel, and the original to the clerk of this court by 12/04/2023, marked for filing in this appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Extending the time to file the Opening Brief from 11/15/2023, to 01/03/2024. FURTHER ORDERED: Directing Court Reporting Supervisor Chris Bleuenstein to notify the Court of Appeals Clerk's Office of the court reporter assigned to prepare the above-listed transcripts. Hon Randall M Howe - Author
- 39. 13-Nov-2023 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 10/12/2018 - Oral Argument - (Catherine Turner on behalf of Gail Ferguson)
- 40. 3-Jan-2024 FILED: Appellant's Joint Opening Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
- 41. 30-Jan-2024 FILED: Unopposed Motion for Procedural Order (Extension for Answering Brief); Certificate of Service (Appellee)
- 42. 31-Jan-2024 ORDERED: Unopposed Motion for Procedural Order (Extension for Answering Brief) (Appellee) = GRANTED. Due date EXTENDED from Monday, 02-12-2024 to Wednesday, 03-13-2024. Geoffrey P Butzine ProTem Judge - Author
- 43. 27-Feb-2024 FILED: Letter, 02/27/2024, from ASC to COA1, re: Returning the record

**Court of Appeals, Division One**

**Criminal**

**1 CA-CR 21-0541**

**STATE v. PURCELL**

**51 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

- 44. 27-Feb-2024 FILED: Additional Record on Appeal  
Physical Exhibits:  
Hearing Date: 06/07/1999 List # 1 in manila envelope  
Hearing Date: 06/07/1999 - List # 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46 47 48 49 50 51 53 54 63 64 65 66 67 68 69 70 71 72 74 75 76 77 78 79 103 106 107 108 109 110 111 112 113 114 115 116 in a manila envelope  
Hearing Date: 04/23/1999 - List # 1 in a manila envelope  
Hearing Date: 09/10/1999 - List # 1 2 in a manila envelope
- 45. 12-Mar-2024 FILED: Appellee's Answering Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
- 46. 26-Mar-2024 FILED: Unopposed Motion for Procedural Order: Extend Reply Brief Deadline; Certificate of Service (Appellant Deshaw & Purcell)
- 47. 26-Mar-2024 ORDERED: Unopposed Motion for Procedural Order: Extend Reply Brief Deadline (Appellant Deshaw & Purcell) = GRANTED. Due date EXTENDED from Monday, 04-01-2024 to Monday, 04-22-2024. Geoffrey P Butzine ProTem Judge - Author
- 48. 29-Mar-2024 FILED: Memorandum – to Clerk of Superior Court Re: any additional record not already transmitted due within 10 days
- 49. 15-Apr-2024 FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record (CR1994-011396)
- 50. 19-Apr-2024 FILED: Appellants' Joint Reply Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
- 51. 26-Apr-2024 CLNDR: CONFERENCE, Department A, 5-28-24, CONFERENCE ROOM.